WEST VIRGINIA LEGISLATURE

REGULAR SESSION, 1990

ENROLLED

COM. Sub. for HOUSE BILL No. 4254

(By & Delegates Buchanan + Sallaghar)

Passed March 10, 1990
In Effect July 1, 1990

ENROLLED

COMMITTEE SUBSTITUTE

FOR

H. B. 4254

(By Delegates Buchanan and Gallagher)

[Passed March 10, 1990; in effect July 1, 1990.]

AN ACT to amend and reenact sections two, five, six, seven. eight, nine, ten, eleven, twelve, thirteen, fifteen, sixteen, seventeen and nineteen, article twenty-one, chapter twenty-nine of the code of West Virginia, one thousand nine hundred thirty-one, as amended; and to further amend said article by adding thereto two new sections, designated sections thirteen-a and twenty-one, all relating to public defender services; definitions of eligible proceeding; executive director; powers and duties of agency; services of criminal law research center; activation and funding of public defender corporations; appointment of public defenders; applications for funding of public defender corporations; increasing compensation and expenses for panel attorneys; authority of board of directors for public defender corporations; eligibility guidelines and supporting affidavits; audits; private practive of law by public defenders; and forgiveness of public defender services loans.

Be it enacted by the Legislature of West Virginia:

That sections two, five, six, seven, eight, nine, ten, eleven, twelve, thirteen, fifteen, sixteen, seventeen and nineteen, article twenty-one, chapter twenty-nine of the code of West

Virginia, one thousand nine hundred thirty-one, as amended, be amended and reenacted; and that said article be further amended by adding thereto two new sections, designated sections thirteen-a and twenty-one, all to read as follows:

ARTICLE 21. PUBLIC DEFENDER SERVICES.

§29-21-2. Definitions.

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

- As used in this article, the following words and phrases are hereby defined:
- 3 (1) "Eligible client": Any person who meets the 4 requirements established by this article to receive 5 publicly funded legal representation in an eligible 6 proceeding as defined herein;
- 7 (2) "Eligible proceeding": Criminal charges which 8 may result in incarceration, juvenile proceedings, 9 proceedings to revoke parole or probation if the 10 revocation may result in incarceration, contempts of 11 court, child abuse and neglect proceedings which may 12 result in a termination of parental rights, mental 13 hygiene commitment proceedings, paternity proceed-14 ings, extradition proceedings, proceedings brought in 15 aid of an eligible proceeding, and appeals from or post 16 conviction challenges to the final judgment in an eligible 17 proceeding. Legal representation provided pursuant to 18 the provisions of this article is limited to the court system of the state of West Virginia, but does not 19 20 include representation in municipal courts unless the 21 accused is at risk of incarceration;
 - (3) "Legal representation": The provision of any legal services or legal assistance consistent with the purposes and provisions of this article;
 - (4) "Private practice of law": The provision of legal representation by a public defender or assistant public defender to a client who is not entitled to receive legal representation under the provisions of this article, but does not include, among other activities, teaching;
 - (5) "Public defender": The staff attorney employed on a full-time basis by a public defender corporation who, in addition to providing direct representation to eligible

- clients, has administrative responsibility for the operation of the public defender corporation. The public defender may be a part-time employee if the board of directors of the public defender corporation finds efficient operation of the corporation does not require a
- full-time attorney and the executive director approves such part-time employment;
- 40 (6) "Assistant public defender": A staff attorney 41 providing direct representation to eligible clients whose 42 salary and status as a full-time or part-time employee 43 are fixed by the board of directors of the public defender 44 corporation;
- 45 (7) "Public defender corporation": A corporation
 46 created under section eight of this article for the sole
 47 purpose of providing legal representation to eligible
 48 clients; and
- 49 (8) "Public defender office": An office operated by a 50 public defender corporation to provide legal represen-51 tation under the provisions of this article.

§29-21-5. Executive director.

- 1 (a) The governor shall appoint, by and with the advice 2 and consent of the Senate, the executive director of 3 public defender services, who shall serve at the will and 4 pleasure of the governor. The executive director shall be 5 a qualified administrator as determined by the gover-6 nor, and shall be a member of the bar of the supreme 7 court of appeals. In addition to the executive director 8 there shall be such other employees as the executive 9 director determines to be necessary. The executive 10 director shall have the authority to promulgate rules, 11 and shall have such other authority and perform such 12 duties as may be required or necessary to effectuate this 13 article. The executive director shall provide supervision 14 and direction to the other agency employees in the 15 performance of their duties.
- 16 (b) The executive director's annual salary shall be as determined by the Legislature.

§29-21-6. Powers, duties and limitations.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

- 1 (a) Consistent with the provisions of this article, the 2 agency is authorized to make grants to and contracts 3 with public defender corporations and with individuals, 4 partnerships, firms, corporations and nonprofit organ-5 izations, for the purpose of providing legal representa-6 tion under this article, and may make such other grants 7 and contracts as are necessary to carry out the purposes 8 and provisions of this article.
 - (b) The agency is authorized to accept, and employ or dispose of in furtherance of the purposes of this article, any money or property, real, personal or mixed, tangible or intangible, received by gift, devise, bequest or otherwise.
 - (c) The agency shall establish and the executive director or his designate shall operate a criminal law research center as provided for in section seven of this article. This center shall undertake directly, or by grant or contract, to serve as a clearinghouse for information; to provide training and technical assistance relating to the delivery of legal representation; and to engage in research, except that broad general legal or policy research unrelated to direct representation of eligible clients may not be undertaken.
 - (d) The agency shall establish and the executive director or his designate shall operate an accounting and auditing division to require and monitor the compliance with this article by public defender corporations and other persons or entities receiving funding or compensation from the agency. This division shall review all plans and proposals for grants and contracts, and shall make a recommendation of approval or disapproval to the executive director. The division shall prepare, or cause to be prepared, reports concerning the evaluation, inspection, or monitoring of public defender corporations and other grantees, contractors, persons or entities receiving financial assistance under this article, and shall further carry out the agency's responsibilities for records and reports as set forth in section eighteen of this article.
 - The accounting and auditing division shall require

41 each public defender corporation to annually report on 42 the billable and nonbillable time of its professional 43 employees, including time utilized in administration of 44 the respective offices, so as to compare such time to 45 similar time expended in nonpublic law offices for like

46

activities.

- The accounting and auditing division shall provide to the executive director assistance in the fiscal administration of all of the agency's divisions. Such assistance shall include, but not be limited to, budget preparation and statistical analysis.
- 52 (e) The agency shall establish and the executive 53 director or a person designated by the executive director 54 shall operate an appellate advocacy division for the 55 purpose of prosecuting litigation on behalf of eligible 56 clients in the supreme court of appeals. The executive 57 director or a person designated by the executive director 58 shall be the director of the appellate advocacy division. 59 The appellate advocacy division shall represent eligible 60 clients upon appointment by the circuit courts, or by the 61 supreme court of appeals. The division may, however, 62 refuse such appointments due to a conflict of interest or 63 if the executive director has determined the existing 64 caseload cannot be increased without jeopardizing the 65 appellate division's ability to provide effective represen-66 tation. In order to effectively and efficiently utilize the 67 resources of the appellate division the executive director 68 may restrict the provision of appellate representation to 69 certain types of cases.
- 70 The executive director is empowered to select and 71 employ staff attorneys to perform the duties prescribed 72 by this subsection. The division shall maintain vouchers 73 and records for representation of eligible clients, for 74 record purposes only.

§29-21-7. Criminal law research center established; functions.

- 1 (a) Within the agency, there shall be a division known 2 as the criminal law research center which may:
- 3 (1) Undertake research, studies and analyses and act

14 15

16

2

3

4

5

6

7

- 4 as a central repository, clearinghouse and disseminator of research materials;
- 6 (2) Prepare and distribute a criminal law manual and 7 other materials and establish and implement standard 8 and specialized training programs for attorneys practic-9 ing criminal law;
- 10 (3) Provide and coordinate continuing legal education 11 programs and services for attorneys practicing criminal 12 law; and
 - (4) Prepare, supplement and disseminate indices and digests of decisions of the West Virginia supreme court of appeals and other courts, statutes and other legal authorities relating to criminal law.
- 17 (b) The services of the criminal law research center 18 shall be offered at reasonable rates or by subscription 19 to prosecuting attorneys and their professional staffs, 20 panel attorneys, and private attorneys engaged in the 21 practice of criminal law. The services may be provided 22 to public defender corporations, public defenders and 23 assistant public defenders at reduced rates.

§29-21-8. Public defender corporations.

- (a) In each judicial circuit of the state, there is hereby created a "public defender corporation" of the circuit: *Provided*, That one such public defender corporation shall serve both the twenty-third and thirty-first judicial circuits. The purpose of such public defender corporations is to provide legal representation in the respective circuits in accordance with the provisions of this article.
- 8 (b) If the judge of a single judge circuit, the chief 9 judge of a multijudge circuit or a majority of the active members of the bar in the circuit determine there is a 10 11 need to activate the corporation they shall certify that 12 fact in writing to the executive director. The executive 13 director shall allocate funds to those corporations so 14 certifying in the order in which he or she deems most 15 efficient and cost effective.
- 16 (c) Public defender corporations may apply in writing 17 to the executive director for permission to merge to form

- 18 multicircuit or regional public defender corporations.
- 19 Applications for mergers shall be subject to the review
- 20 procedures set forth in section eleven of this article.

§29-21-9. Panel attorneys.

 $\begin{array}{c} 21 \\ 22 \end{array}$

- (a) In each circuit of the state, the circuit court shall establish and maintain regional and local panels of private attorneys-at-law who shall be available to serve as counsel for eligible clients.
- (b) An attorney-at-law may become a panel attorney and be enrolled on the regional or local panel, or both, to serve as counsel for eligible clients, by informing the court. A prospective panel attorney shall inform the court in writing, on forms provided by the executive director, of a desire to accept appointments generally, or of the specific types of cases in which he or she will accept appointments. The attorney shall also indicate whether or not he or she will accept appointments in adjoining circuits and, if so, in which circuits. An agreement to accept cases generally or certain types of cases particularly shall not prevent a panel attorney from declining an appointment in a specific case.
 - (c) In all cases where an attorney-at-law is required to be appointed for an eligible client, the appointment shall be made by the circuit judge. In circuits where a public defender office is in operation, the judge shall appoint the public defender office unless such appointment is not appropriate due to a conflict of interest or unless the public defender corporation board of directors or the public defender, with the approval of the board, has notified the court that the existing caseload cannot be increased without jeopardizing the ability of defenders to provide effective representation.

If the public defender office is not available for appointment, the court shall appoint one or more panel attorneys from the local panel. If there is no local panel attorney available, the judge shall appoint one or more panel attorneys from the regional panel. If there is no regional panel attorney available, the judge may appoint a public defender office from an adjoining circuit if such public defender office agrees to the appointment.

37 In circuits where no public defender office is in 38 operation, the judge shall first refer to the local panel 39 and then to the regional panel in making appointments, 40 and if an appointment cannot be made from the panel 41 attorneys, the judge may appoint the public defender 42 office of an adjoining circuit if the office agrees to the 43 appointment. In any circuit, when there is no public defender, or assistant public defender, local panel 44 45 attorney or regional panel attorney available, the judge 46 may appoint one or more qualified private attorneys to 47 provide representation, and such private attorney or 48 attorneys shall be treated as panel attorneys for that specific case. In any given case, the appointing judge 49 50 may alter the order in which attorneys are appointed if the case requires particular knowledge or experience on 51 52 the part of the attorney to be appointed.

§29-21-10. Public defender corporation—Intent to apply for funding.

- 1 (a) Any public defender corporation applying to 2 public defender services for financial assistance to 3 establish a program to provide legal representation or 4 proposing a major substantive modification to an 5 existing program shall notify the executive director and 6 the circuit judges in the area in which the program will 7 deliver legal representation of the intent to apply for 8 such assistance or modification. Such notice shall be 9 given at least thirty days prior to the filing of an 10 application or a proposal for modification.
- 11 (b) Notifications shall include a summary description 12 of the proposed program. The summary description 13 shall contain the following information:
- 14 (1) The identity of the applicant;
- 15 (2) The geographical area to be served by the pro-16 posed program;
- 17 (3) A brief description of the proposed program, 18 general size or scale, estimated cost, or other character-19 istics which will enable the circuit court to determine 20 how the system for representation of indigents within 21 the circuit may be affected by the proposed program;

- 22 and
- 23 (4) The estimated date the public defender corpora-
- 24 tion expects to formally file an application or modifica-
- 25 tion proposal.

§29-21-11. Public defender corporations—Funding applications; legal representation plans; review.

- 1 (a) Any public defender corporation or any other 2 entity wishing to secure state financial assistance 3 through the agency shall submit a funding application
- 4 to the executive director.
- 5 (b) The funding application, which is to be submitted 6 in a form prescribed by the executive director, shall 7 contain a general description of the plans and policies 8 the applicant intends to utilize in providing legal 9 representation, and such other information prescribed by the executive director.
- 11 (c) All applications for financial assistance from 12 public defender services under the provisions of this 13 article must be submitted to the circuit judges of the 14 circuit for review prior to their submission to public 15 defender services.
- 16 Reviews shall be completed by circuit judges within 17 fifteen days after receipt. If the public defender 18 corporation or other applicant has not received a 19 response within the fifteen-day period, the public 20 defender corporation may consider the judge to have 21 waived his or her opportunity to review and comment 22 on the proposed program or program modification and 23 may submit the application to public defender services.
- 24 (d) Completed applications shall include:
- 25 (1) All comments and recommendations made by the 26 circuit judges, along with a statement that such 27 comments have been considered prior to submission of 28 the application; or
- 29 (2) If no comments have been received from circuit 30 judges, a statement that the procedures outlined in this section have been followed and that no comments or

32 recommendations have been received.

defender §29-21-12. Public corporation funding applications.

- 1 (a) If an application does not carry evidence that
- 2 appropriate circuit judges have been given an opportun-
- 3 ity to review the application, the application shall be
- 4 returned with instructions to fulfill the requirements of
- 5 section eleven of this article.
- 6 (b) The executive director shall within seven working 7
- days after taking any major action on an application 8
- notify the circuit judges who have reviewed the appli-
- 9 cation of the action taken. Major actions include
- 10 program approvals, rejections, returns for amendment,
- 11 deferrals or withdrawals.
- 12 (c) If a judge has recommended against approval, or
- 13 has recommended approval only with specific and major
- 14 substantive changes, and the executive director ap-
- 15 proves the application substantially as submitted, the
- 16 executive director shall provide the judge with an
- 17 explanation of the approval of the application.

Approval of public defender corporation §29-21-13. funding applications; funding; record keeping by public defender corporations.

- 1 (a) The accounting and auditing division shall review
- all funding applications and prepare recommendations
- 3 for an operating plan and budget. The executive
- 4 director shall review the funding applications and the
- 5 accounting and auditing recommendations and shall, in 6 consultation with the applicants, prepare a plan for
- 7 providing legal services.
- 8 (b) Upon final approval of a funding application by 9 the executive director, the approved budget shall be set
- 10 forth in an approval notice. The total cost to the agency
- 11 shall not exceed the amount set forth in the approval
- 12 notice and the agency shall not be obligated to reim-
- 13 burse the recipient for costs incurred in excess of the
- 14 amount unless and until a program modification has
- 15 been approved in accordance with the provisions of this
- 16 article.

- 17 (c) Funding of public defender corporations or other 18 programs or entities providing legal representation 19 under the provisions of this article shall be by annual 20 grants disbursed in such periodic allotments as the 21 executive director shall deem appropriate.
- 22 (d) All recipients of funding under this article shall 23 maintain such records as required by the executive 24 director.

§29-21-13a. Compensation and expenses for panel attorneys.

- 1 (a) All panel attorneys shall maintain detailed and 2 accurate records of the time expended and expenses 3 incurred on behalf of eligible clients, and upon completion of each case, exclusive of appeal, shall submit to the 4 5 appointing court a voucher for services. Claims for fees 6 and expense reimbursements shall be submitted to the 7 appointing court on forms approved by the executive 8 director. The appointing court shall review the voucher 9 to determine if the time and expense claims are reasonable, necessary and valid and shall forward the 10 11 voucher to the agency with an order approving payment 12 of the claimed amount or of such lesser sum the court 13 considers appropriate. Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, public defender services may 14 15 pay by direct bill, prior to the completion of the case, 16 litigation expenses incurred by attorneys appointed 17 under this article: *Provided*, That a panel attorney may 18 be compensated for services rendered and reimbursed 19 for expenses incurred prior to the completion of the case 20 where (1) more than six months have expired since the 21 commencement of the panel attorney's representation in 22 the case; and (2) no prior payment of attorney fees has 23 been made to the panel attorney by public defender services during the case: Provided, however, That the 24 25 amounts of any fees or expenses paid to the panel attorney on such an interim basis, when combined with 26 27 any such amounts paid to the panel attorney at the conclusion of the case, shall not exceed the limitations 28 29 on fees and expenses imposed by this section.
- 30 (b) In each case in which a panel attorney provides

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57 58

59

60 61

62

63

64 65

66

67

68

69

- legal representation under this article, and in each appeal after conviction in circuit court, the panel attorney shall be compensated at the following rates for actual and necessary time expended for services performed and expenses incurred subsequent to the effective date of this article:
 - (1) For work performed out of court, compensation shall be at the rate of forty-five dollars per hour. Out-of-court work includes, but is not limited to, travel, interviews of clients or witnesses, preparation of pleadings, and prehearing or pretrial research.
 - (2) For work performed in court, compensation shall be at the rate of sixty-five dollars per hour. In-court work includes, but is not limited to, all time spent awaiting hearing or trial if the presence of the attorney is required at the time.
 - (3) The maximum amount of compensation for out-ofcourt and in-court work under this subsection is as follows: For proceedings of any kind involving felonies for which a penalty of life imprisonment may be imposed, such amount as the court may approve; for all other eligible proceedings, three thousand dollars.
 - (c) Actual and necessary expenses incurred in providing legal representation, including, but not limited to, expenses for travel, transcripts, salaried or contracted investigative services, and expert witnesses shall be reimbursed to a maximum of fifteen hundred dollars unless the court, for good cause shown, gives advance approval to incur expenses for a larger sum: Provided. That when an attorney is appointed to a case outside of the circuit where his or her principal office is located. travel expenses incurred for travel as the result of providing legal representation in the case shall be reimbursed not withstanding the fifteen hundred dollar limit provided by this subsection: Provided, however, That notwithstanding any other provision of this article, these travel expenses incurred by an attorney appointed to a case outside of his or her circuit as aforesaid shall be reimbursed by public defender services prior to the completion of the case upon the request of the panel

- 71 attorney on such forms approved by the executive 72 director.
- Expense vouchers shall specifically set forth the nature, amount and purpose of expenses incurred and shall provide such receipts, invoices or other documentation required by the executive director.

78

79

80

- (d) For purposes of compensation under this section, an appeal to the supreme court of appeals from a final order of the circuit court shall be considered a separate case.
- 81 (e) Vouchers submitted under this section shall 82 specifically set forth the nature of the service rendered. 83 the stage of proceeding or type of hearing involved, the 84 date and place the service was rendered and the amount 85 of time expended in each instance. All time claimed on 86 the vouchers shall be itemized to the nearest tenth of an 87 hour. If the charge against the eligible client for which 88 services were rendered is one of several charges 89 involving multiple warrants or indictments, the voucher 90 shall indicate such fact and sufficiently identify the 91 several charges so as to enable the court to avoid a 92 duplication of compensation for services rendered. The 93 voucher shall indicate whether the services were 94 rendered by a local panel attorney, a regional panel 95 attorney, or such other private attorney as may have 96 been appointed. The executive director shall refuse to 97 requisition payment for any voucher which is not in conformity with the record keeping, compensation or 98 99 other provisions of this article and in such circumstance 100 shall return the voucher to the court for further review.

§29-21-15. Public defender corporations—Board of directors.

- 1 (a) The governing body of each public defender 2 corporation shall be a board of directors consisting of 3 persons who are residents of the area to be served by 4 the public defender corporation.
- 5 (1) In multi-county circuits, and in the case of multi-6 circuit or regional corporations, the county commission 7 of each county within the area served shall appoint a

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

- 8 director, who shall not be an attorney-at-law. The 9 president of each county bar association within the area 10 served shall appoint a director, who shall be an attorneyat-law: Provided, That in a county where there is not an 11 12 organized and active bar association, the circuit court 13 shall convene a meeting of the members of the bar of 14 the court resident within the county and such members 15 of the bar shall elect one of their number as a director. 16 The governor shall appoint one director, who shall serve 17 as chairman, who may be an attorney-at-law, unless 18 such appointment would result in there being an even 19 number of directors, in which event the governor shall 20 appoint two directors, one of whom may be an attorney-21 at-law.
 - (2) In single-county circuits, the manner of selecting directors shall be the same as that described in subdivision (1) of this subsection, except that the county commission shall appoint two directors rather than one, and the bar shall appoint two directors rather than one.
 - (b) The board of directors shall have at least four meetings a year. Timely and effective prior public notice of all meetings shall be given, and all meetings shall be public except for those concerned with matters properly discussed in executive session.
 - (c) The board of directors shall establish and enforce broad policies governing the operation of the public defender corporation but shall not interfere with any attorney's professional responsibilities to clients. The duties of the board of directors shall include, but not be limited to, the following:
 - (1) Appointment of the public defender and any assistant public defenders as may be necessary to enable the public defender corporation to provide legal representation to eligible clients; and
- 42 (2) Approval of the public defender corporation's 43 budget and the fixing of professional and clerical 44 salaries; and
- 45 (3) Renewal of the employment contract of the public defender on an annual basis except where such renewal

- 47 is denied for cause: *Provided*, That the board of directors 48 shall have the power at any time to remove the public 49 defender for misfeasance, malfeasance or nonfeasance.
- 50 (d) To the extent that the provisions of chapter thirty-51 one of this code regarding nonprofit corporations are not 52 inconsistent with this article, the provisions of such 53 chapter shall be applicable to the board of directors of 54 the public defender corporation.
- (e) While serving on the board of directors, no member may receive compensation from the public defender corporation, but a member may receive payment for normal travel and other out-of-pocket expenses required for fulfillment of the obligations of membership.
- §29-21-16. Determination of maximum income levels; eligibility guidelines; use of form affidavit; inquiry by court; denial of services; repayment; limitation on remedies against affiant.
 - 1 (a) The agency shall establish, and periodically review 2 and update financial guidelines for determining eligibil-3 ity for legal representation made available under the 4 provisions of this article. The agency shall adopt a 5 financial affidavit form for use by persons seeking legal 6 representation made available under the provisions of this article.
 - (b) All persons seeking legal representation made available under the provisions of this article shall complete the agency's financial affidavit form, which shall be considered as an application for the provision of publicly funded legal representation.

9

10

11 12

13 (c) Any juvenile shall have the right to be effectively 14 represented by counsel at all stages of proceedings 15 brought under the provisions of article five, chapter 16 forty-nine of this code. If the child advises the court of his or her inability to pay for counsel, the court shall 17 require the child's parent or custodian to execute a 18 financial affidavit. If the financial affidavit demon-19 20 strates that neither of the child's parents, or, if

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56 57

58

59

60

61

21 applicable, the child's custodian, has sufficient assets to 22 pay for counsel, the court shall appoint counsel for the 23 child. If the financial affidavit demonstrates that either 24 of the child's parents, or, if applicable, the child's 25 custodian, does have sufficient assets to pay for counsel. 26 the court shall order the parent, or, if applicable, the 27 custodian, to provide, by paving for, legal representation 28 for the child in the proceedings.

The court may disregard the assets of the child's parents or custodian and appoint counsel for the child, as provided above, if the court concludes, as a matter of law, that the child and the parent or custodian have a conflict of interest that would adversely affect the child's right to effective representation of counsel, or concludes, as a matter of law, that requiring the child's parent or custodian to provide legal representation for the child would otherwise jeopardize the best interests of the child.

(d) In circuits in which no public defender office is in operation, circuit judges shall make all determinations of eligibility. In circuits in which a public defender office is in operation, all determinations of indigency shall be made by a public defender office employee designated by the executive director. Such determinations shall be made after a careful review of the financial affidavit submitted by the person seeking representation. The review of the affidavit shall be conducted in accord with the financial eligibility guidelines established by the agency pursuant to subsection (a) of this section. In addition to the financial eligibility guidelines, the person determining eligibility shall consider other relevant factors, including, but not limited to, those set forth in subdivisions (1) through (8) of subsection (e) of this section. If there is substantial reason to doubt the accuracy of information in the financial affidavit, the person determining eligibility may make such inquiries as are necessary to determine whether the affiant has truthfully and completely disclosed the required financial information.

After reviewing all pertinent matters the person determining eligibility may find the affiant to be

62 eligible to have the total cost of legal representation 63 provided by the state, or may find that the total cost of 64 providing representation shall be apportioned between 65 the state and the eligible person. A person whose annual 66 income exceeds the maximum annual income level 67 allowed for eligibility may receive all or part of the 68 necessary legal representation, or a person whose 69 income falls below the maximum annual income level 70 for eligibility may be denied all or part of the necessary 71 legal representation if the person determining eligibility 72 finds the person's particular circumstances require that 73 eligibility be allowed or disallowed, as the case may be. on the basis of one or more of the eight factors set forth 74 75 in subsection (e) of this section. If legal representation 76 is made available to a person whose income exceeds the 77 maximum annual income level for eligibility, or if legal 78 representation is denied to a person whose income falls 79 below the maximum annual income level for eligibility, 80 the person determining eligibility shall make a written 81 statement of the reasons for the action and shall 82 specifically relate those reasons to one or more of the 83 factors set forth in subsection (e) of this section.

- (e) The following factors shall be considered in determining eligibility for legal representation made available under the provisions of this article:
- 87 (1) Current income prospects, taking into account seasonal variations in income;

84

85

- 89 (2) Liquid assets, assets which may provide collateral 90 to obtain funds to employ private counsel and other 91 assets which may be liquidated to provide funds to 92 employ private counsel;
- 93 (3) Fixed debts and obligations, including federal, state and local taxes and medical expenses;
- 95 (4) Child care, transportation and other expenses necessary for employment;
- 97 (5) Age or physical infirmity of resident family 98 members;
- 99 (6) Whether the person seeking publicly funded legal 100 representation has made reasonable and diligent efforts

129

130 131

- to obtain private legal representation, and the results of those efforts;
- 103 (7) The cost of obtaining private legal representation 104 with respect to the particular matter in which assistance 105 is sought;
- 106 (8) Whether the person seeking publicly funded legal 107 representation has posted a cash bond for bail or has 108 obtained release on bond for bail through the services 109 of a professional bondsman for compensation and the 110 amount and source of the money provided for such bond;
- 111 (9) The consequences for the individual if legal 112 assistance is denied.
- 113 (f) Legal representation requested by the affiant may 114 not be denied in whole or part unless the affiant can obtain legal representation without undue financial 115 116 hardship. Persons determined to be ineligible by public 117 defender personnel may have the initial determination 118 reviewed by a local circuit judge who may amend, 119 modify or rewrite the initial determination. At any stage 120 of the proceedings a circuit court may determine a prior 121 finding of eligibility was incorrect or has become 122 incorrect as the result of the affiant's changed financial 123 circumstances, and may revoke any prior order provid-124 ing legal representation. In such event any attorney 125 previously appointed shall be entitled to compensation 126 under the provisions of law applicable to such appoint-127 ment for services already rendered.
 - (g) In the circumstances and manner set forth below, circuit judges may order repayment to the state, through the office of the clerk of the circuit court having jurisdiction over the proceedings, of the costs of representation provided under this article:
- 133 (1) In every case in which services are provided to an 134 indigent person and an adverse judgment has been 135 rendered against such person, the court may require 136 that person, and in juvenile cases, may require the 137 juvenile's parents or custodian, to pay as costs the 138 compensation of appointed counsel, the expenses of the 139 defense and such other fees and costs as authorized by

140 statute.

171

- (2) The court shall not order a person to pay costs unless the person is able to pay without undue hardship. In determining the amount and method of repayment of costs, the court shall take account of the financial resources of the person, the person's ability to pay and the nature of the burden that payment of costs will impose. The fact that the court initially determines, at the time of a case's conclusion, that it is not proper to order the repayment of costs does not preclude the court from subsequently ordering repayment should the person's financial circumstances change.
 - (3) When a person is ordered to repay costs, the court may order payment to be made forthwith or within a specified period of time or in specified installments. If a person is sentenced to a term of imprisonment, an order for repayment of costs is not enforceable during the period of imprisonment unless the court expressly finds, at the time of sentencing, that the person has sufficient assets to pay the amounts ordered to be paid or finds there is a reasonable likelihood the person will acquire the necessary assets in the foreseeable future.
 - (4) A person who has been ordered to repay costs, and who is not in contumacious default in the payment thereof, may at any time petition the sentencing court for modification of the repayment order. If it appears to the satisfaction of the court that continued payment of the amount ordered will impose undue hardship on the person or the person's dependents, the court may modify the method or amount of payment.
 - (5) When a person ordered to pay costs is also placed on probation or imposition or execution of sentence is suspended, the court may make the repayment of costs a condition of probation or suspension of sentence.
 - (h) Circuit clerks shall keep a record of repaid counsel fees and defense expenses collected pursuant to this section and shall, quarterly, pay the moneys to the state auditor who shall deposit the funds in the general revenue fund of the state.

3

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

179 (i) The making of an affidavit subject to inquiry 180 under this section does not in any event give rise to criminal remedies against the affiant nor occasion any 181 182 civil action against the affiant except for the recovery 183 of costs as in any other case where costs may be 184 recovered and the recovery of the value of services, if 185 any, provided pursuant to this article. A person who has 186 made an affidavit knowing the contents thereof to be 187 false may be prosecuted for false swearing as provided 188 by law.

§29-21-17. Private practice of law by public defenders.

- (a) No full-time public defender or full-time assistant public defender may engage in any private practice of law except as provided in this section.
- 4 (b) A board of directors may permit a newly em-5 ployed full-time public defender or full-time assistant 6 public defender to engage in the private practice of law 7 for compensation for the sole purpose of expeditiously 8 closing and withdrawing from existing private cases 9 from a prior private practice. In no event shall any 10 person employed for more than ninety days as a fulltime public defender or full-time assistant public 11 12 defender be engaged in any other private practice of law for compensation: Provided, That the prohibition against 13 the private practice of law does not apply to full-time 14 15 public defenders employed in class III or class IV 16 counties as defined by article seven, chapter seven of 17 this code.
 - (c) A board of directors may permit a full-time public defender or full-time assistant public defender to engage in private practice for compensation if the defender is acting pursuant to an appointment made under a court rule or practice of equal applicability to all attorneys in the jurisdiction and if the defender remits to the public defender corporation all compensation received.
 - (d) A board of directors may permit a full-time public defender or full-time assistant public defender to engage in uncompensated private practice of law if the public defender or assistant public defender is acting:

- 29 (1) Pursuant to an appointment made under a court
- 30 rule or practice of equal applicability to all attorneys in
- 31 the jurisdiction; or
- 32 (2) On behalf of a close friend or family member; or
- 33 (3) On behalf of a religious, community or charitable 34 group.
- 35 (e) Violation of the requirements of this section is 36 sufficient grounds for immediate summary dismissal.

§29-21-19. Audits.

- 1 (a) The accounts of each public defender corporation
 2 shall be audited annually as soon as possible after the
 3 end of each state fiscal year. Such audits shall be
 4 conducted in accordance with generally accepted
 5 auditing standards by the state tax commissioner.
- 6 (b) The audits shall be conducted at the place or 7 places where the accounts of the public defender 8 corporation are normally kept. All books, accounts, 9 financial records, reports, files, and other papers or 10 property belonging to or in use by the public defender 11 corporation and necessary to facilitate the audits shall 12 be made available to the person or persons conducting 13 the audits; and full facilities for verifying transactions
- with the balances and securities held by depositories, fiscal agents, and custodians shall be afforded to any
- such person.(c) The report of the annual audit shall be filed with
- the agency and shall be available for public inspection during business hours at the principal office of the public defender corporation. The report of each such
- 21 audit shall be maintained for a period of at least five
- 22 years at the office of the agency.

§29-21-21. Forgiveness of loans; reversion of public defender corporation assets.

- 1 All equipment, operational or supplemental loans
- 2 heretofore made under the former provisions of article
- 3 twenty-one are forgiven and declared null and void and
- shall not be an obligation of a public defender corporation formerly established under the previous provisions

Enr. Com. Sub. for H. B. 4254] 22

- 6 of article twenty-one, nor an obligation of any successor
- 7 organization or of the members of any board of directors
- 8 of any public defender corporation.

23 [Enr. Com. Sub. for H. B. 4254

The Joint Committee on Enrolled Bills hereby certifies that the foregoing bill is correctly enrolled.
Millille L. Larker Chairman Senate Committee
Bernard V. Kelly Chairman House Committee
Originating in the House.
Takes effect July 1, 1990.
Clerk of the Senate
Openald & Kopp Clerk of the House of Delegates
Resident of the Senate
Speaker of the House of Delegates
The within to appuall this the after day of March 11, 1990.
day of March M. 1990. Willyon
@ GOVERNOY Governor/

PRESENTED TO THE

3/

//

time 4:40